



G R E E R
G A L L O W A Y
C O N S U L T I N G
E N G I N E E R S

2A-640 Cataraqui Woods Drive
Kingston, Ontario
K7P 2Y5

Telephone
(613) 536-5420

Facsimile
(613) 548-3793

E-mail
Kingston@greergalloway.com



April 12, 2024

The Corporation of the Township of Edwardsburgh/Cardinal

Attention: Chris Leblanc, Public Works Manager

Re: Jordan Road Culvert Replacement – Tender EC-PW-24-06

Mr. Leblanc,

The tender for the Jordan Road Culvert Replacements closed on April 9th, 2024, 2024 2:00pm. A total of 8 tender bids were received. The Greer Galloway Group inc. (GGG) has reviewed the submissions for the 3 lowest bids and offers the following:

The lowest 3 bidder results are summarized below.

Ranking	Contractor	Total Bid Excluding HST	Comments
1	Core Civil Construction inc. (CCC)	\$172,035.40	2 Noted irregularities: 1. No contact information provided On Statement "A" for the projects presented as bidder's experience. 2. 2 Item prices lower than the other two bidders to a noteworthy degree.
2	Robert Nash Excavating Inc. (RNE)	\$225,820.29	1 Noted irregularity: 1. Shortest list on Statement "A" for the projects presented as bidder's experience.
3	Willis Kerr Contracting Ltd. (WKC)	\$238,745.00	In compliance with tender requirements. No irregularities of note.

Irregularities with Core Civil Construction Inc. Bid Submission

GGG has no previous experience working with this company. GGG was able to contact public works staff with the City of Ottawa (where the entirety of CCC's listed experience was garnered) and they confirmed that CCC has a proven track record of completing projects of a similar value and scope in a satisfactory manner. It is recommended that CCC's omission of reference contact information in this instance be excused.

For the following items CCC's bid was found to be quite low:

Item	Tender Value	As Percentage of Average of 3 Lowest Bids	As Percentage of Designer Estimate
4 - Dewatering	\$8,518.40	35%	43%



G R E E R
G A L L O W A Y
C O N S U L T I N G
E N G I N E E R S

8 - Removal of Existing Culverts	\$690.00	9%	3%
----------------------------------	----------	----	----

GGG has reviewed both of these items against the designed specifications included in the contract. While low, these items are not so low as to lead GGG to believe the Contractor has overlooked some key component of the work.

Irregularities with Robert Nash Excavating Inc. Bid Submission

RNE has the shortest list of experience on their Statement "A" submission. GGG has worked with RNE on several past projects, including one of their listed projects (Kidd Road Box Culvert). They have a proven record of completing projects of a similar value and scope in a satisfactory manner. It is recommended their short list of past work not be treated as of concern.

Recommendation

It is our recommendation that the tender be awarded (in full) to the lowest eligible bidder, Core Civil Construction Inc., in the amount of \$172,035.40 (excluding HST) for the Jorden road Culvert Replacement Project. The contractor has submitted all the required documentation, along with a proper bid bond. Contact was made with The Contractor's listed previous client despite the Contractor having not provided contact information, and a positive recommendation was provided.

If you have any further questions or concerns regarding this assessment, please do not hesitate to contact us.

Sincerely,

**GREER GALLOWAY
CONSULTING ENGINEERS**

Kevin Hawley, P.Eng
Project Manager

2A-640 Cataraqui Woods Drive

Kingston, Ontario

K7P 2Y5

Telephone

(613) 536-5420

Facsimile

(613) 548-3793

E-mail

Kingston@greergalloway.com